# UNITED STATES FILED ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AGENCY REGION 6 DALLAS, TEXAS REGIONAL MEANING CHERK EPA REGION VI

IN THE MATTER OF:	§	•
	<b>§</b>	DOCKET NO. FIFRA 06-2014-0317
Boasso America	§	
100 Intermodal Drive	§	
Chalmette, LA 70043	§	
	§	
Nalco Company	§	
3628 Highway 44	Š	
Garyville, Louisiana 70051	Š	COMPLAINT
	Š	CONSENT AGREEMENT AND
	Š	FINAL ORDER
RESPONDENTS	§	

## COMPLAINT CONSENT AGREEMENT AND FINAL ORDER

The Director, Multimedia Planning and Permitting Division, United States

Environmental Protection Agency, Region 6 (EPA) as Complainant, and Nalco Company located
in Garyville, Louisiana, and Boasso America located in Chalmette, Louisiana (Respondents) in
the above referenced action, have consented to the terms of this Complaint Consent Agreement
and Final Order (Complaint CAFO).

NOW THEREFORE, before the taking of any testimony, without any adjudication of any issues of law or fact herein, the parties agree to the terms of this Complaint CAFO.

## I. PRELIMINARY STATEMENT

1. This enforcement proceeding is instituted by EPA pursuant to Section 14(a) of the Federal Insecticide, Fungicide, and Rodenticide Act, 7 U.S.C. § 136*l*(a) (FIFRA) which authorizes the Administrator to bring an administrative action to assess a penalty of up to \$7,500<sup>1</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup>The Civil Penalty Inflation Adjustment Rule (62 Fed Reg. 13514, March 20, 1997 and 69 Fed Reg. 7121, February 13, 2004) provides for increases in the statutory penalty provisions for violations which occur after the

for each violation of Section 12(a)(1)(E) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136j(a)(1)(E) (sold or distributed a misbranded pesticide). This proceeding is initiated by the issuance of a Complaint and Notice of Opportunity for Hearing (Complaint) incorporated herein.

- 2. The Complaint alleges the Respondents violated regulations promulgated pursuant to FIFRA.
- 3. For purposes of this proceeding, the Respondents admit to the jurisdiction of this Complaint; however, Respondents neither admit nor deny the specific factual allegations contained in this Complaint.
- 4. The Respondents consent to the issuance of this Complaint CAFO hereinafter recited and consent to the assessment and payment of the stated civil penalty in the amount and by the method set out in this Complaint CAFO in settlement of the violations alleged in this Complaint CAFO.
- 5. By signature on this Complaint CAFO, the Respondents waive any right to a hearing and/or any appeal of this proceeding.
- 6. The Respondents represent that it is duly authorized to execute this Complaint CAFO and that the party signing this Complaint CAFO on behalf of the Respondent is duly authorized to bind the Respondents to the terms and conditions of this Complaint CAFO.
- 7. The Respondents agree that the provisions of this Complaint CAFO shall be binding on its officers, directors, employees, agents, servants, authorized representatives, successors, and assigns, including but not limited to, subsequent purchasers.

date the increases take effect. For violations after March 14, 2004, the potential maximum penalty for such violations changed from \$5,500 to \$6,500. The Agency is required to review its penalties once every four years and adjust them for inflation. The Final Rule published at 73 Fed Reg. 75340 raised the FIFRA penalty to \$7,500 for violations occurring after December 11, 2008.

## II. STATUTORY AND REGULATORY BACKGROUND

- 8. Section 2(s) of FIFRA defines a "person" as any individual, partnership, association, corporation, or any organized group of persons whether incorporated or not.
- 9. Section 2(u) of FIFRA defines the term "pesticide" as any substance or mixture of substances intended for preventing, destroying, repelling, or mitigating any pest.
- 10. Section 2(gg) of FIFRA defines the term "to distribute or sell" as distribute, sell, offer for sale, hold for distribution, hold for shipment, or receive and (having so received) deliver or offer to deliver.
- 11. Section 2(p) of FIFRA defines "label" as the written, printed, or graphic matter on, or attached to, the pesticide or device or any of its containers or wrappers.
- 12. Section 2(q) of FIFRA defines "misbranded" as the label having a statement, design, or graphic representation that is false or misleading.
- 13. Section 2(w) of FFIRA defines "produce" as to manufacture, prepare, compound, propagate, or process any pesticide or device or active ingredient used in producing a pesticide. ("Production" includes formulation, packaging, repackaging, labeling and relabeling.)
- 14. Importation procedures are outlined under Section 17(c) of FIFRA, whereby the EPA determines whether or not a pesticide is adulterated or misbranded.
- 15. Pursuant to Section 12(a)(1)(E) of FIFRA "...it shall be unlawful for any person who is a registrant, wholesaler, dealer, retailer, or other distributor fail to sell or distribute a pesticide or device which is misbranded."
- 16. Pursuant to Section 14(a)(1) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136*l*(a)(1), any registrant, commercial applicator, wholesaler, dealer, retailer, or other distributor who violates any provision of FIFRA may be assessed a civil penalty by the Administrator of not more than

 $$7,500^2$  for each offense.

## III. FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS OF LAW

- 17. The Respondents are Boasso America located at 100 Intermodal Dr, Chalmette,Louisiana 70043 and Nalco Company located at 3628 Highway 44, Garyville, Louisiana 70051.
  - 18. Respondents are a "person" as that term is defined in Section 2(s) of FIFRA.
- 19. Respondents are a registrant, wholesaler, dealer, retailer or other distributor subject to the civil penalty provisions of Section 14(a)(1) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136*l*(a)(1).
- 20. The product, Polymer Aqueous Solution Prism 9762, is not a pesticide as defined in FIFRA Section 2(u).
- 21. The product, Bentazon Manufacturer's Concentrate (EPA Reg. No.7969-84), is a pesticide as defined in FIFRA Section 2(u).
- 22. At all relevant times, the Respondents were a "distributor," as that term is defined at Section 2(gg) of FIFRA, of the pesticide described in paragraph 21.
- 23. On or about April 9, 2014, a Boasso America driver was directed by Hoyer Global USA, Inc. to move a container of Polymer Aqueous Solution Prism 9762 to the Port of Houston for export on the behalf of Nalco Company.
- 24. En route, the container of Polymer Aqueous Solution Prism 9762 was damaged and returned to Boasso America.
- 25. On or about April 23, 2014, a driver was instructed by Hoyer Global USA, Inc. to move the damaged container of Polymer Aqueous Solution Prism 9762 to Nalco, so that it may be placed in an undamaged container.
  - 26. The driver for Boasso America inadvertently picked up BASF's container of

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup>See footnote 1.

Bentazon Manufacturer's Concentrate (EPA Reg. No.7969-84).

- 27. The pesticide described in paragraph 21 was delivered to Nalco Company in Garyville, Louisiana.
- 28. BASF's container of Bentazon Manufacturer's Concentrate (EPA Reg. No. 7969-84) was repackaged into a new container at the Nalco Company's establishment (EPA Est. No. 1706-LA-001) in Garyville, Louisiana and the final container did not bear a pesticide label.
- 29. The newly repackaged container of Bentazon Manufacturer's Concentrate (EPA Reg. No. 7969-84), which allegedly was believed to be Polymer Aqueous Solution Prism 9762, was transported to the Port of Houston.
  - 30. The container was loaded onto the vessel Frisia Lissabon-00137-S destined for Chile.
- 31. On or about April 25, 2014, the vessel described in paragraph 30 departed the Port of Houston.
- 32. On or about May 1, 2014, Boasso America discovered that BASF's container of Bentazon Manufacturer's Concentrate was repackaged at Nalco Company instead of the Polymer Aqueous Solution Prism 9762.
  - 33. Boasso America alerted Hoyer Global USA, Inc. and BASF to this error.
- 34. The vessel Frisia Lissabon-00137-S was instructed to return to the Port of Houston, so that the violative container of Bentazon Manufacturer's Concentrate could be destroyed by the Importer of Record, Hoyer Global USA, Inc.
- 35. Section 12(a)(1)(E) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136j(a)(1)(E), provides that it shall be unlawful for any person who is a registrant, wholesaler, dealer, retailer, or other distributor to sell or distribute a misbranded pesticide.

#### **VIOLATIONS**

- 36. Complainant incorporates by reference the allegations contained in paragraphs 1-35 of this Complaint CAFO.
- 37. Section 12(a)(1)(E) of FIFRA states that it is unlawful for a registrant, wholesaler, retailer, or distributor to sell or distribute a misbranded pesticide.
- 38. At the time of exportation, the product described in paragraph 21 was misbranded, due the product not bearing a pesticide label.
- 39. By shipping the pesticide for export, the Respondents distributed the pesticide described in paragraph 21.
- 40. Respondent's distribution or sale of the misbranded pesticide product, Bentazon Manufacturer's Concentrate (EPA Reg. No.7969-84), constituted an unlawful act in violation of Section 12(a)(1)(E) of FIFRA.

## V. <u>CIVIL PENALTY AND</u> TERMS OF SETTLEMENT

41. For the reasons set forth above, Respondent has agreed to pay a civil penalty, which has been determined in accordance with Section 14(a)(1) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136*l*(a)(1), and the Civil Penalty Inflation Adjustment Rule<sup>3</sup> which authorizes EPA to assess a civil penalty of up to SEVEN THOUSAND FIVE HUNDRED DOLLARS (\$7,500.00)<sup>3</sup> for each violation of FIFRA. Upon consideration of the entire record herein, including the Findings of Fact and Conclusions of Law, which are hereby adopted and made a part hereof, and upon consideration of (1) the size of the Respondent's business, (2) the effect upon Respondent's ability to continue

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> See footnote 1.

in business, and (3) the gravity of the alleged violation, the parties agree to the terms of this settlement. To develop the proposed penalty in this Complaint, the Complainant has taken into account the particular facts and circumstances of this case with specific reference to EPA's "Enforcement Response Policy for the Federal Insecticide, Fungicide, and Rodenticide Act (FIFRA)" dated December 3, 2009, located at:

http://www.epa.gov/Compliance/resources/policies/civil/erp/index.html. It is ORDERED that Respondent be assessed a civil penalty of THREE THOUSAND SIX HUNDRED DOLLARS AND NO CENTS (\$3, 600.00).

42. Within thirty (30) days of Respondent's receipt of this fully executed Complaint CAFO, Respondent shall pay the assessed civil penalty by cashier's or certified check, made payable to "Treasurer, United States of America, EPA - Region 6."

Payment shall be remitted in one of the alternatives provided in the collection information section below:

#### **COLLECTION INFORMATION**

#### **CHECK PAYMENTS:**

US Environmental Protection Agency Fines and Penalties Cincinnati Finance Center PO Box 979077 St. Louis, MO 63197-900

#### WIRE TRANSFERS:

Wire transfers should be directed to:
Federal Reserve Bank of New York

ABA = 021030004

Account = 68010727

SWIFT address = FRNYUS33

33 Liberty Street

New York NY 10045

Field Tag 4200 of the Fedwire message should read "D 68010727 Environmental Protection Agency"

#### **OVERNIGHT MAIL:**

U.S. Bank 1005 Convention Plaza Mail Station SL-MO-C2GL St. Louis, MO 63101 Contact: Natalie Pearson 314-418-4087

#### ACH (also known as REX or remittance express)

Automated Clearinghouse (ACH) for receiving US currency PNC Bank 808 17<sup>th</sup> Street, NW Washington, DC 20074 Contact – Jesse White 301-887-6548 ABA = 051036706 Transaction Code 22 - checking Environmental Protection Agency Account 310006 CTX Format

#### ON LINE PAYMENT:

There is now an On Line Payment Option, available through the Dept. of Treasury. This payment option can be accessed from the information below:

WWW.PAY.GOV

Enter "sfo 1.1" in the search field;

Open form and complete required fields following directions for EPA Miscellaneous payments.

#### **EPA Miscellaneous Payments - Cincinnati Finance Center**

Form Number: SFO Form Number 1.1

Use this form to pay civil penalties, FOIA request, Superfund, Citations, Compliance Orders, and other miscellaneous payments

PLEASE NOTE: <u>Docket number FIFRA-06-2014-0317</u> shall be clearly typed on the check to ensure proper credit. Respondent shall send a simultaneous notice of such payment, including a copy of the money order or check to the following:

Kristin Dunbar Pesticides Section (6PD-P) U.S. EPA, Region 6 1445 Ross Avenue, Suite 1200 Dallas, TX 75202-2733

The check shall reference the Respondent's name and address, the case name and the docket number of the administrative complaint, and the check shall be accompanied by a transmittal letter. A photocopy of each check and its accompanying transmittal letter shall be mailed to:

Region 6 Hearing Clerk U.S. EPA, Region 6 1445 Ross Avenue, Suite 1200 Dallas, Texas 75202-2733

Respondent's adherence to this request will ensure proper credit is given to the matter at hand.

- 43. Respondent agrees not to claim, or attempt to claim, a federal income tax deduction or credit covering all or any part of the civil penalty paid to the United States Treasurer.
- 44. Pursuant to 31 U.S.C. § 3717 and 40 C.F.R. § 13.11 unless otherwise prohibited by law, EPA will assess interest and late payment penalties on outstanding debts owed to the United States and a charge to cover the costs of processing and handling a delinquent claim. Interest on the civil penalty assessed in this CAFO will begin to accrue thirty (30) days after the effective date of the CAFO and will be recovered by EPA on any amount of the civil penalty that is not paid by the respective due date. Interest will be assessed at the rate of the United States Treasury tax and loan rate in accordance with 40 C.F.R. § 13.11(a). Moreover, the costs of the Agency's administrative handling of overdue debts will be charged and assessed monthly throughout the period the debt is overdue. See 40 C.F.R. § 13.11(b).
- 45. The EPA will also assess a \$15.00 administrative handling charge for administrative costs on unpaid penalties for the first thirty (30) day period after the payment is due and an additional \$15.00 for each subsequent thirty (30) day period that the penalty remains unpaid. In

addition, a penalty charge of up to six percent per year will be assessed monthly on any portion of the debt which remains delinquent more than ninety (90) days. See 40 C.F.R. § 13.11 (c). Should a penalty charge on the debt be required, it shall accrue from the first day payment is delinquent. See 31 C.F.R. § 901.9(d). Other penalties for failure to make a payment may also apply.

VI. COSTS 46. Each party shall bear its own costs and attorneys fees.

IT IS SO AGREED:

FOR THE RESPONDENT:

Date: <u>July 22, 20</u>14

Stephanie Perez Nalco Company 3628 Highway 44 Garyville, LA 70051

Date: 7/29/14

Tony Ortego Boasso America 100 Intermodal Drive

Chalmette, LA 70043

FOR THE COMPLAINANT:

Date: 08/04/14

Craig G. Carroll

Chief

**Pesticides Section** 

#### FINAL ORDER

Pursuant to Section 14(a) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136/(a), and the Consolidated Rules of Practice Governing the Administrative Assessment of Civil Penalties, 40 C.F.R. Part 22, the foregoing Consent Agreement is hereby ratified. This Final Order shall not in any case affect the right of EPA or the United States to pursue appropriate injunctive or other equitable relief or criminal sanctions for any violations of law. This Final Order shall resolve only those causes of action and/or violations alleged in the Complaint. Nothing in this Final Order shall be construed to waive, extinguish or otherwise affect Respondent's (or its officers, agents, servants, employees, successors, or assigns) obligation to comply with all applicable federal, state, and local statutes and regulations, including the regulations that were the subject of this action. The Respondent is ordered to comply with the terms of settlement and the civil penalty payment instructions as set forth in the Consent Agreement. In accordance with 40 C.F.R. § 22.31(b), this Final Order shall become effective upon filing with the Regional Hearing Clerk.

Dated 8/5/14

Thomas Rucki

Regional Judicial Officer

#### CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that on the day of fusial, 2014, the original and one copy of the foregoing Complaint Consent Agreement and Final Order ("Complaint CAFO") was hand delivered to the Regional Hearing Clerk, U.S. EPA - Region 6, 1445 Ross Avenue, Dallas, Texas 75202-2733, and a true and correct copy was delivered to the following individual by method indicated below:

#### **CERTIFIED MAIL - RETURN RECEIPT REQUESTED**

Stephanie Perez Nalco Company 3628 Highway 44 Garyville, LA 70051

Tony Ortego Boasso America 100 Intermodal Drive Chalmette, LA 70043

> Kristin Dunbar Enforcement Officer Pesticides Section